

Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

THUCYDIDES VII. 75

Interpretation and Discussion

Μετά δὲ τοῦτο, ἐπειδὴ ἐδόκει τῷ Νικία καὶ τῷ Δημοσθένει ἰκανῶς παρεσκευάσθαι, καὶ ἡ ἀνάστασις ήδη τοῦ στρατεύματος τρίτη ἡμέρα ἀπὸ τῆς ναυμαχίας έγίγνετοδεινόν οὖν ἦν οὐ καθ' εν μόνον τῶν πραγμάτων, δτι τάς τε ναῦς ἀπολωλεκότες πάσας άπεχώρουν καὶ άντὶ μεγάλης έλπίδος καὶ αυτοί καὶ ἡ πόλις κινδυνεύοντες, άλλά καὶ ἐν τῆ ἀπολείψει τοῦ στρατοπέδου ξυνέβαινε τῆ τε ὄψει ἐκάστω άλγεινὰ καὶ τῆ γνώμη αίσθέσθαι. των τε γάρ νεκρών άτάφων όντων, όπότε τις ίδοι τινά των έπιτηδείων κείμενον, ές λύπην μετά φόβου καθίστατο, καί οί ζῶντες καταλειπόμενοι τραυματίαι τε καὶ ἀσθενεῖς πολὺ τῶν τεθνεώτων τοῖς ζῶσι λυπηρότεροι ἦσαν καὶ τῶν ἀπολωλότων άθλίωτεροι. πρός γάρ άντιβολίαν και όλοφυρμόν τραπόμενοι ές άπορίαν καθίστασαν, άγειν τε σφάς άξιουντες και ένα έκαστον επιβοώμενοι, εί τινά πού τις ίδοι ή 10 έταίρων ή οίκείων, των τε ξυσκήνων ήδη άπιόντων έκκρεμαννύμενοι καὶ έπακολουθοῦντες ές δσον δύναιντο, εἴ τω δὲ προλίποι ἡ ρώμη καὶ τὸ σῶμα, οὐκ ἄνευ [ὁλίγων] ἐπιθειασμῶν καὶ οἰμωγῆς ὑπολειπόμενοι. ὥστε δάκρυσι πᾶν τὸ στράτευμα πλησθέν καὶ ἀπορία τοιαύτη μή ραδίως άφορμασθαι, καίπερ έκ πολεμίας τε καὶ μείζω ή κατά δάκρυα τὰ μέν πεπονθότας ήδη, τὰ δὲ περὶ τῶν ἐν ἀφανεῖ δεδιότας μὴ πάθωσι. κατήφειά τέ τις ἄμα 15 καὶ κατάμεμψις σφῶν αὐτῶν πολλή ἦν. οὐδὲν γὰρ ἄλλο ἢ πόλει ἐκπεπολιορκημένη ἐψκεσαν ὑποφευγούση, καὶ ταύτη οὐ σμικρᾳ· μυριάδες γὰρ τοῦ ξύμπαντος δχλου οὐκ έλάσσους τεσσάρων ἄμα ἐπορεύοντο. καὶ τούτων οῖ τε ἄλλοι ἔφερον πάντες ὅ τι τις έδυνατο έκαστος χρήσιμον, και οι όπλιται και οι ίππης παρά το είωθος αυτοί τα σφέτερα αὐτῶν σιτία ἐπὶ τοῖς ὅπλοις, οἱ μὲν ἀπορία ἀκολούθων, οἱ δὲ ἀπιστία ἀπηυτομο- 20 λήκεσαν γάρ πάλαι τε καί οι πλεϊστοι παραχρημα. Εφερον δε ούδε ταῦτα ἰκανά σῖτος γὰρ οὐκέτι ἦν ἐν τῷ στρατοπέδφ. καὶ μὴν ἡ ἄλλη αἰκία καὶ ἡ ἰσομοιρία τῶν κακῶν, ἔχουσά τινα όμως τὸ μετὰ πολλῶν κούφισιν, οὐδ' ὡς ῥαδία ἐν τῷ παρόντι έδοξάζετο, αλλως τε και από οίας λαμπρότητος και αυχήματος του πρώτου ès οίαν τελευτήν καὶ ταπεινότητα άφικτο. μέγιστον γάρ δή τὸ διάφορον τοῦτο Ἑλληνικῷ 25 στρατεύματι έγένετο, οίς άντι μέν τοῦ ἄλλους δουλωσομένους ήκειν αὐτοὺς τοῦτο μᾶλλον δεδιότας μή πάθωσι ξυνέβη άπιέναι, άντὶ δ' εύχῆς τε καὶ παιάνων, μεθ' ὧν ἐξέπλεον, πάλιν τούτων τοις έναντίοις έπιφημίσμασιν άφορμασθαι, πεζούς τε άντὶ ναυβατών πορευομένους καὶ ὁπλιτικῷ προσέχοντας μᾶλλον ή ναυτικῷ. δμως δὲ ὑπὸ μεγέθους τοῦ ἐπικρεμαμένου ἔτι κινδύνου πάντα ταῦτα αὐτοῖς οἰστὰ ἐφαίνετο. 30

After this, when it seemed to Nicias and Demosthenes that adequate preparation had been made, the departure of the army took place on the third day following the sea-fight. And terrible it was, not in one particular only of their circumstances, that namely, they were going away after losing all their ships, and in place of high hopes with danger threatening themselves and their city, but also in that on the abandonment of the camp there fell to each one to see things painful to the eye and grievous to the mind. For, since the dead were unburied, whenever anybody saw anyone of his friends lying dead, he was plunged into grief mingled with fear, and those that were left behind alive, wounded and weak, far more than the dead were painful to the living, and indeed were more wretched than those that had perished. For turning to entreaty and lamentation, they caused perplexity, praying to be taken along, and calling aloud each upon any companion or kinsman whom he might see, clinging to their tent-mates as they were going away, and following after them as far as they were able, and when spirit and strength failed them falling behind, not without faint imprecations and wailings; so that the whole army was filled with grief, and in such perplexity did not easily get off, even though out of a hostile country, and not only having already endured sufferings too great for tears, but fearing also for the future what they might still have to suffer.

Dejection there was, too, and much self-condemnation. For they were like nothing else than a city forced out by siege, and secretly fleeing away, and that no small city: for of the whole multitude not less than four myriads were on the march together, and of these the rest bore whatever each could that was serviceable, while the hoplites and the horsemen, contrary to their wont, themselves carried their own food in addition to their arms, some of them through lack of attendants, others through distrust of them; for these had deserted, some long agc, but the greater part recently. And not even thus did they carry food enough; for it was no longer in the camp.

Moreover, the rest of their misery and the equal sharing of their sufferings, although having in this very participation with the many some alleviation, did not even thus seem easy, especially considering with what splendor and brilliancy they had set out and to what a humiliating end they had come. For this was indeed the very greatest reverse that had ever happened to an Hellenic host, whom it befell that after coming to enslave others they were going away in fear lest they might rather themselves suffer this, and in place of prayers and paeans with which they had sailed out they were starting back with presages quite the reverse of these, going as foot-soldiers instead of seamen, and relying upon the hoplite force rather than upon the fleet. And yet, by reason of the magnitude of the danger still impending, all these things seemed to them tolerable.

In such descriptions as this, Thucydides displays his peculiar power, rising in style at once to suit the occasion, having a grander rhythm than ordinary, appropriating words from the poets, from Homer and the Drama, borrowing from the Ionic, coining new terms. We should feel his kinship at once with Aeschylus and Pindar, even if the Scholiast had never said, $l\sigma\tau\dot{\epsilon}o\nu$ $\ddot{\sigma}\tau\iota$ $\epsilon\dot{l}s$ $\tau\dot{\sigma}$ $\kappa o\mu$ - $\psi\dot{\sigma}\nu$ $\tau\ddot{\eta}s$ $\phi\rho\dot{\alpha}\sigma\epsilon\omega s$ $\Lambda l\sigma\chi\dot{\nu}\lambda\sigma\nu$ $\kappa\alpha\dot{\iota}$ $\Pi l\nu\delta\alpha\rho\sigma\nu$ $\dot{\epsilon}\mu\iota\mu\dot{\eta}\sigma\alpha\tau\sigma$. He is not struggling with the language, with a material not yet fully adapted to the

purposes of prose narration. He is master of the language. He does as he pleases with his own, as a great creative genius always has the right to do. He consciously avoids at such times the ordinary language of daily life and creates for himself a great literary dialect. He coins new words, not because Attic prose is undeveloped, or because the existing prose vocabulary is poor, but because he is rich, because he is essentially a poet.

He uses rare terms and unusual forms of expression because ordinary words have traditional associations that may detract from the dignity of the subject at such a time. He uses poetical terms, because poetry alone can adequately express deep human passion and pathos, and because these words have been, in a measure, sacred to his readers from their earliest use of their great national textbook in poetry, or are associated in their minds with all that has so moved and thrilled and purified them in their own great Drama, in the Agamemnon, the Oedipus Rex, the Antigone. The effect was like borrowing great Biblical words, which everybody knows and which are consecrated by association, to describe some event of unusual moment.

Like the great Greek artist that he is, and so unlike the modern artist, he gives just enough particulars to make the picture clear and real, only so much detail as will stamp the impression indelibly, leaving all the rest to the imagination. Thucydides is a master of stern pathos, the pathos of naked awful facts expressed by a few vivid touches, by a few words fitly chosen or coined to reveal the depth and hopelessness of woe, a suffering "too great for tears," under which the heart simply sinks and despairs. Because of this, he is a great poet. And so with words freshly made and burdened with his great meaning, or others rich with old poetical associations, he paints with few but unforgetable details pictures that remain graven upon the memory forever; as, for example, in this book, the sea-fight in the Great Harbor (cc. 70, 71), the present chapter, the butchery at the river Assinarus (c. 84), the awful sufferings of the Athenian captives in the Syracusan stone-quarries (c. 87).

Mahaffy calls him "the cold Thucydides"; but he is not cold any more than Sophocles is "narrow in his sympathies"—Mahaffy again. He is stern; he is self-restrained; he is austere. He does not permit himself usually to moralize on the enormities of the horrors he describes, because the stern and awful facts are in themselves adequate to effect not only the rousing but the purgation of the feelings.

By reason of the unapproachable faculty of the Greeks for expressive compounds, Thucydides can play upon the same stem without seeming to try to be clever and without lowering the dignity of the narration. Compare, for example, κατήφειά τις ἄμα καὶ κατάμεμψις σφῶν αῦτῶν.(15) When he speaks of the abandonment of the camp, his word is ἀπόλειψις; when the sick and wounded are left behind in the camp, the verb is καταλειπόμενοι; when the poor deserted men try to follow their tent-mates, but strength and spirit fail before they overtake them, the verb is προλίποι; when thus, with imprecations and lamentations, they 'are gradually getting left behind, the verb is ὑπολειπόμενοι (with Vat.).

The style may be at times overinfluenced by the rhetorical taste of the period; there may be evident even here, as sometimes elsewhere, a too conscious seeking after antitheses which become a little strained, if not artificial. But the total impression is that of simple majesty, and not of artificiality or bombast.

To discuss the language of the chapter a little more in detail: such a periphrasis as ἀνάστασις εγίγνετο (2) is a common device of Thucydides to give greater weight or solemnity to his language. The phrase οὐ καθ' ξυ μόνου τῶυ πραγμάτων (3)—to say nothing of the difficulty of explanation—is certainly unusual in Thucydides in all three times (ii 39. 22; 43. 28; vii. 75. 8), is in usage overwhelmingly poetical; as is also κείμενον (7), lying dead, which is borrowed from the constant usage of Homer and the Tragedians. The phrase ès λύπην μετὰ φόβου (7) at once arrests the attention by its unusualness. rpavuarias (7), wounded, occurs only once more in Thucydides (viii 27. 19), who has it in common, it would seem, only with Herodotus (iii 79) and the poets. Pindar frg. 244, and the name of a play cited by Aristotle (Poet. 14. 13) δ τραυματίας 'Οδυσσεύς (probably by Sophocles). Another striking instance of the avoidance of ordinary usage is άντιβολία (9) for iκετεία or iκεσία, which was doubtless coined for this occasion, though it occurs in a frg. of Eupolis.² ολοφυρμός is another

 $^{^{1}}$ Cf. Hdt. V. 78.1 δηλοῖ οὐ κατ' ἔν μοῦνον άλλὰ πανταχỹ.

² Plato has ἀντιβόλησις, and the verb ἀντιβολέω, entreat, is common enough.

rare word which Thucydides employs four times (111. 67. 8; vi. 30. 13; vii. 71. 14; 75. 14), and may have coined, as he did δλόφυρσις (i. 143. 29; ii. 57. 22), from the epic verb ολοφύρομαι, which he uses also four times (ii. 34. 11; 44. 2; vi. 78. 16; vii. 30. 21). ἐπιβοώμενοι (10), invoking, is Ionic and poetical. The phrase ή βώμη και τὸ σῶμα (12) whether taken as ordinarily explained, as equivalent to δώμη τοῦ σώματος, or, as Classen thinks, "force of spirit and body" (see his App. on vi. 31. 3), is certainly an unusual and striking combination; and the verb προλιπεῖν (12), fail beforehand, seems to occur elsewhere only in the poets. In the difficult and much discussed phrase οὐκ ἄνευ ὀλίγων ἐπιθειασμῶν καὶ οίμω $\gamma \tilde{\eta}$ s (12), όλί $\gamma \omega \nu$, if it means faint, as Classen explains, is poetical. ἐπιθειασμῶν, obtestationum, which Thucydides has only here, seems to have been coined by him, as was doubtless the verb ἐπιθεάζειν, obtestari per deos (ii. 75. 1; viii. 53.11). οίμωγή—elsewhere in Thucydides only in vii. 71.32—was borrowed from the poets. construction δάκρυσι πλησθέν (13) is also poetical; and the touching and forceful phrase μείζω η κατά δάκρυα (14), too great for tears, Thucydides borrowed probably either from Herodotus or Bacchylides. κατήφεια (15), dejection, he got either from Homer or the Tragic poets, while κατάμεμψις (16), self-condemnation, which bears it company, he doubtless coined. The use of ἀκόλουθοι (20), attendants, as in vi. 31. 1, for which Thucydides elsewhere generally employs θεράποντες (iv. 16.9; vii. 13.9) οτ ὑπηρέται (iii. 70.10; vi. 102.10), is in keeping with the general tenor of the vocabulary of this chapter; and ἀπηυτομολήκεσαν (20), which is fresh from Thucydides' mint, is used elsewhere only by late writers.

³ Cf. ἐπακολουθεῖν, l. 11; iv. 96.19; 127.11; 128.10; v. 65.23; vi. 70.15; viii 10.9.

ταπεινότης (25) was possibly borrowed from Herodotus (iv. 22. 10). It occurs nowhere else in the history, as indeed the adjective ταπεινός occurs only once (ii. 61.12). ἀντί (26) with articular infinitive occurs only once more in Thucydides (i. 69.24), and the same construction without the article occurs also just twice in Herodotus. ἐπιφήμισμα (28), presage, ill-omened word, occurs only here in Thucydides, and even Bloomfield has been able to find it elsewhere only in Josephus (Bell. vii. 5.1 Ant. xviii. 5.2) and Libanius (Or. p. 509). It was coined doubtless after Herodotus' use of the verb ἐπιφημίζεσθαι (iii. 124.8). ναυβάτης (28) is τραγικώτερον, according to Pollux (i. 95), as indeed the examples of its use prove.

Το sum up then, there are in this chapter the following ἄπαξ εlρημένα: ἀντιβολία (9), ἐκκρεμάννυσθαι (11), ἐπιθειασμός (12), κατήφεια (15), ἀπηυτομολεῖν (20), αἰκία (22), κούφισις (23), ταπεινότης (25), ἐπιφήμισμα (28). The following seem to have been coined by Thucydides: ἀντιβολία (9), ὀλοφυρμός (9), ἐπιθειασμός (12), κατάμεμψις (16), ἰσομοιρία (22), κούφισις (23), ἐπιφήμισμα (28), From poetical usage seem to have been borrowed the following: ἀλγεινά (5), κείμενος (7), ἐπιβοώμενοι (10), προλίπεῖν (12), ὁλίγος (12), οἰμωγή, (13), κατήφεια (15), αἰκία (22), αῦχημα (24), ναυβάτης (29), and the constructions δάκρυσι . . . πλησθέν (13), μείζω ἢ κατὰ δάκρυα (14), οὐδ' ις (23), and ἀπὸ οἴας ἐς οἵαν (24).

A fuller discussion of three phrases is appended. οὐκ ἄνευ ὀλίγων ἐπιθειασμῶν: the vulgate has been objected to by almost all editors. The sense that would at first sight seem to be required is not without many imprecations, and Valla translates non sine multis obtestationibus ac ploratibus. To get this sense, Arnold explains that the negative must be repeated, as if we had οὐκ ἄνευ οὐκ ὀλίγων. Classen offers an explanation which I once rejected, but am now inclined to favor. He understands δλίγων of "the weak, scarcely audible voice of the dying, in their last complaints and appeals to the gods." In support of this view he cites Hom. 492, φθεγξάμενος δλίγη όπί, and c. 44.19, κραυγη οὐκ όλίγη χρώμενοι, where the meaning is evidently not much but loud crying. Possibly also in i.73.3 αἰσθόμενοι δὲ καταβοὴν οὐκ δλίγην οὖσαν ἡμῶν παρήλθομεν, this may be the meaning of οὐκ ὀλίγην. We may compare also ὀλιγόπνους, scant of breath (Hesychius) and όλιγόφωνος, with little tone (Aristid. Quintil. p. 43); also όλιγοδρανέων, doing little, feeble, (Hom. O. 246, II, 843, Χ 337) ὀλιγοδρανής (Ar. Av. 686), ὀλιγοδρανία (Aesch. Prom. 548).

Not unlike in force is apaid in Theocritus xiii. 59, those lovely lines of which Tennyson said, "I should be content to die if I had written anything equal to this." Heracles is seeking his love, the lost Hylas:

τρὶς μèν "Υλαν ἄυσεν, ὅσον βαθὺς ἥρυγε λαιμός τρὶς δ' ἄρ' ὁ παῖς ὑπάκουσεν, ἀραιὰ δ' ἴκετο φωνά ἐξ ὕδατος, παρεών δὲ μάλα σχεδὸν εἴδετο πόρρω,

"Three times he called Hylas, as loud as his deep throat could call,

And three times the boy heard, but faint came his voice from the water,

And near though he was seemed to come from afar."

This is about the force too of exiguam in Vergil, Aeneid vi. 492. When the chief of the Danai sees the mailed hero, pars tollere vocem exiguam—a passage which Tennyson may have had in mind when he wrote: "And if his fellow spake, his voice was thin, as voices from the grave."

Cf. Death of Oenone,

"Anon from out the long ravine below, She heard a wailing cry, that seemed at first Thin as the bat-like shrillings of the dead When driven to Hades."

Also M. Arnold, In Utrumque Paratus:

"Thin, thin the pleasant human noises grow, And faint the city gleams."

The same general quality of voice is implied in Suetonius, Nero 20, quamquam exiguae vocis et fuscae. Cf. Ovid, Fasti V. 457, Umbra. . . . visa est haec exiguo murmure verba loqui. Similar in English is the use of small in the following passages, i Kings 19.12, "And after the fire a still small voice"; Shaks. Mid. N. D. 1.1, "You may speak as small as you will." "I'll speak in a monstrous little voice"; M. W. of Windsor 1.1, "She has brown hair and speaks small like a woman"; Chaucer, Miller's Tale i. 174, "He syngeth in his voys gentil and smal"; "Lytell Geste of Robin Hode (Child's Ballads v. 121), "He herde

the notes smal Of byrdes mery syngynge"; Tennyson, The Two Voices,

"A still small voice spake unto me,
Thou art so full of misery,
Were it not better not to be?"
and Quain, Med. Dict. p. 112, "The small hard wiry pulse."

δάκρυσι πᾶν τὸ στράτευμα πλησθέν: the use of the dative instead of genitive is a poetical construction. Cf. Hom. II 373 οὶ δὲ ἰαχῆ φόβω τε πάσας πλῆσαν ὁδούς; Aesch. Pers. 136 λέκτρα δ' ἀνδρῶν πόθω πίμπλαται δακρύμασιν; Aesch. Sept. 459 μυκτηροκόμποις πνεύμασιν πληρούμενοι; Soph. O. T. 779 ἀνὴρ γὰρ ἐν δείπνοις μ' ὑπερπλησθεὶς μέθη; Soph. frg. 483 πέμφιγι πλήσας ὄψιν; Eur. Or. 1363, δακρύοισι γὰρ Ἑλλάδ' ἄπασαν ἔπλησε.

μείζω ή κατὰ δάκρυα, too great for tears. For other similar turns of construction in Thucydides, cf. i. 76.17 δικαιότεροι ἢ κατὰ τὴν ὑπάρχουσαν δύναμιν γεγένηνται; ii. 50.2 γενόμενον γὰρ κρεῖσσον λόγου τὸ εἶδος τῆς νόσου τά τε ἄλλα χαλεπωτέρως ἢ κατὰ τὴν ἀνθρωπείαν φύσιν προσέπιπτεν ἐκάστω; v. 102. 2 ἀλλ' ἐπιστάμεθα τὰ πῶν πολέμων ἔστιν ὅτε κοινοτέρας τὰς τύχας λαμβάνοντα ἢ κατὰ τὸ διαφέρον ἐκατέρων πλῆθος; vi. 15.10 ταῖς ἐπιθυμίαις μείζοσιν ἢ κατὰ τὴν ὑπάρχουσαν οὐσίαν ἐχρῆτο ἔς τε τὰς ἰπποτροφίας καὶ τὰς ἄλλας δαπάνας; vii. 45.5 ὅπλα μέντοι ἔτι πλείω ἢ κατὰ τοὐς νεκροὺς ἐλήφθη.

As to the passage under consideration, Bloomfield says, "For this truly elegant turn of expression more adapted to lyric poetry than the plain prose of historical narrative our author was probably indebted to a passage of Bacchylides cited by Wasse, μεῖζον ἢ κατὰ δάκρυα." The passage in Bacchylides, which seems to have been incorrectly quoted, was probably frg. 45 αἰαὶ τέκος ἀμέτερον, μεῖζον ἢ πενθεῖν ἐφάνη κακόν, ἀφθέγκτοισιν ἴσον. Cf. Hdt. iii 14.40 μέζω κακὰ ἢ ὥστε ἀνακλαίειν. With the sentiment may be compared Seneca's curae leves loquuntur, ingentes stupent and Shakespeare's "Light sorrows speak, great grief is dumb." So Shakespeare again (Macbeth iv. 3.209),

"Give sorrow words; the grief that does not speak Whispers the o'erfraught heart, and bids it break."

And here Coleridge's Dejection naturally suggests itself,
"A grief without a pang, void, dark and drear,
A stifled, drowsy, unimpassioned grief,
Which finds no natural outlet, no relief,
In word or sigh or tear."

But exactly the Greek idiom is found in Wordsworth's Ode on Intimations of Immortality,

"To me the meanest flower that blows can give
Thoughts that do often lie too deep for tears";
and in Browning's Colombe's Birthday, Act IV,
"I laughed—for 'twas past tears—that Cleves should starve."

CHARLES FORSTER SMITH.

University of Wisconsin.